

**Summary Minutes of the  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)  
Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC)  
Lead Review Panel  
Public Teleconference  
April 1, 2013**

Date and Time: Monday, April 1, 2013, 1:00 PM – 4:00 PM ET

Location: By telephone only

Purpose: The purpose of the meeting was to review two draft reports entitled “*CASAC Review of the EPA’s Integrated Science Assessment for Lead (Third External Review Draft – November 2012)*” and “*CASAC Review of the EPA’s Policy Assessment for the Review of the Lead National Ambient Air Quality Standards (External Review Draft – January 2013)*”

Participants: Lead Review Panel (for full panel, see roster<sup>1</sup>)

Dr. H. Christopher Frey, CASAC Chair

Mr. George Allen

Dr. Herbert Allen

Dr. Richard Canfield

Dr. Deborah Cory-Slechta

Dr. Philip Goodrum

Dr. Philip Hopke

Dr. Chris Johnson

Dr. Susan Korrick

Dr. Michael Kosnett

Dr. Roman Lanno

Mr. Richard Poirot

Dr. Joel Pounds

Dr. Michael Rabinowitz

Dr. William Stubblefield

Dr. Ian von Lindern

Dr. Gail Wasserman

Dr. Michael Weitzman

Mr. Aaron Yeow, Designated Federal Office (DFO)

Dr. John Vandenberg, EPA National Center for Environmental Assessment (NCEA)

Ms. Lydia Wegman, EPA Office of Air Quality and Planning Standards (OAQPS)

Other Attendees (See Attachment A)

## **Opening Remarks**

Mr. Aaron Yeow, DFO, opened the meeting. He noted that as required under the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA), the Panel's deliberations are held in public with advanced notice given in the Federal Register<sup>2</sup>, and the meeting minutes will be made publicly available after the meeting. He noted that the Panel received one written public comment from EPA OAQPS and that EPA NCEA and EPA OAQPS requested to make oral statements. He stated that the SAB Staff Office reviewed information provided by the panel and determined that there were no issues with conflict-of-interest nor any issues with an appearance of a lack of impartiality for any of the panel members. He then turned the meeting over to Dr. Christopher Frey, Chair of the CASAC.

Dr. Frey welcomed everyone and gave an overview of the Agenda<sup>3</sup>.

## **Public Comments on the Draft ISA Report**

There were no public comments so the panel proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

## **EPA Comments on the Draft ISA Report**

Dr. John Vandenberg, EPA NCEA, thanked the panel members for their advice and for the hard work put into drafting the report. He wanted to assure the panel that all their comments, in the letter to the Administrator, in the consensus responses, as well as in their individual comments are taken very seriously and given much consideration. He asked that the panel consider clarifying the strength of the recommendations throughout the report to ensure that they accurately reflect the intention of the panel.

## **Discussion on the Draft ISA Report**

### *Discussion of Consensus Responses*

The panel agreed to strengthen the recommendation for EPA to continue developing a new Pb air sampler (page 10, line 31). A panel member agreed to provide the citation to the study indicating elevated Pb levels in honeybees nearing general aviation airports (page 11, line 28). A panel member agreed to provide revisions to the last paragraph of the Chapter 4 consensus response to more specifically incorporate the individual comments pertaining to the challenge of estimating the air Pb to blood Pb ratio at low Pb exposures (p. 12, lines 14-15). The panel had some discussion regarding the causal association between low Pb exposure levels and renal dysfunction. They agreed to strengthen their recommendation for EPA to change the causal designation from "likely to be a causal relationship" to "suggestive of a causal relationship." The panel agreed to soften the recommendation for the need for causal determination graphs for ecological effects (p. 19, lines 33-35).

### *Discussion of Letter to the Administrator*

The panel agreed to clarify the comments and recommendations on lines 30-35 of the first page of the letter. The panel also agreed to revise the letter to make it consistent with the revisions discussed for the consensus responses.

## **Public Comments on the Draft PA Report**

There were no public comments so the panel proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

## **EPA Comments on the Draft PA Report**

Ms. Lydia Wegman, EPA OAQPS, indicated that they had provided written comments<sup>4</sup> to the panel and she provided an overview of those comments which centered on the panel's comments and recommendations on the cause and impact of the export of Pb to other countries.

Dr. Frey proposed revisions to the letter (lines 26-42, page 2; lines 1-5, page 3) to make it clear that it was a separate policy issue and that the panel did not consider that issue in providing comments on the current NAAQS review documents. The panel agreed to the revisions.

## **Discussion on the Draft PA Report**

### *Discussion of Consensus Responses*

The panel agreed to revisions to the consensus response to Chapter 1 (lines 11-14, 27-32, page 9), consistent with the proposed revisions to the letter the panel had just previously discussed. The panel agreed to various other editorial changes throughout the consensus responses to make the report more clear.

### *Discussion of Letter to the Administrator*

In addition to the revisions to the letter previously discussed by the panel, the panel also agreed to revisions to clarify the comments and recommendations on the secondary standard (lines 15-17, page 2). Dr. Frey indicated that the Draft Secretariat of the Commission for Environmental Cooperation (CEC) report<sup>5</sup> was sent to the panel members and he read the main conclusions and recommendations from the report. The panel agreed with the recommendations.

Dr. Frey discussed the remaining schedule for the review, including the Chartered CASAC quality review on May 8, 2013 to discuss the draft reports.

Mr. Yeow noted that this was the last time the panel would be gathered together and thanked the panel for their past three years of service. He then adjourned the meeting at 4:00 PM.

Respectfully Submitted:

*/Signed/*

---

Mr. Aaron Yeow  
Designated Federal Officer  
EPA SAB Staff Office

Certified as Accurate:

*/Signed/*

---

Dr. H. Christopher Frey  
Chair  
CASAC

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by Panel members during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect consensus advice from the Panel members. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings.

## Materials Cited

The following meeting materials are available on the CASAC website: <http://www.epa.gov/casac>, at the [April 1, 2013 CASAC Lead Review Panel Meeting page](#):

---

<sup>1</sup> Roster

<sup>2</sup> Federal Register Notice Announcing the Meeting

<sup>3</sup> Agenda for April 1, 2013 Public Meeting

<sup>4</sup> EPA OAQPS Comments on the Draft PA Report

<sup>5</sup> Reference to the Secretariat of the Commission for Environmental Cooperation (CEC) Draft Report

**ATTACHMENT A – Other Attendees  
CASAC Lead Review Panel Public Meeting**

**Monday, April 1, 2013**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Affiliation</b>
Hannon, John	USEPA
Hines, Erin	USEPA
Kirrane, Ellen	USEPA
Knight, Chris	Clean Air Report
Kotchmar, Dennis	USEPA
Lassiter, Meredith	USEPA
Martin, Karen	USEPA
Meacham, Connie	USEPA
Miksad, Roger	Wiley Rein LLP
Murphy, Deirdre	USEPA
Orlin, David	USEPA
Owens, Elizabeth	USEPA
Patel, Molini	USEPA
Putzrath, Resha	Navy and Marine Corps Public Health Center
Ross, Mary	USEPA
Svendsgaard, David	USEPA
Tennant, Ginger	USEPA
Wilson, Linda	New York State Office of the Attorney General